An Investigation into a More Effective Second Language Teaching Learning Process Through a Clinical Supervision Integrated Model

සමෝධානික අධීක්ෂණ කිුිිිියාවලියක් තුළින් වඩා එලදායී දෙවන බස ඉගෙනුම් ඉගැන්වීම් කිුිිියාවලියක් සඳහා කරනු ලබන වීමර්ෂණාත්මක අධ්යයනයක්

Jayalath Basnagoda

සාරසංකෂ්පය

අධිකාරී බලය, වැරදි සෙවීම හා විවේචනය වැනි ලක්ෂණ පවතින අධීක්ෂණ කුම ඕනෑම ක්ෂේතුයකට ඉතා අහිතකර බලපෑමක් එල්ලවිය හැක. පුධාන වශයෙන් සෞඛා ක්ෂේතුයේ භාවිත කරමින් සිටී. ශීු ලංකා සන්දර්භය තුළ ගුරු පුහුණු කාර්යේ යෙදී සිටින උපාධාායරිවරුන් සහ අධීක්ෂණ නිළධාරීන් හට අධීක්ෂණ කටයුතු පිළිබඳ තිබෙන නවීන දැනුම ඉතා අල්ප බව නිරීක්ෂණය වී තිබේ. මෙම සමාලෝචන ලිපිය මගින් දෙවන බස ඉගෙනුම් ඉගැන්වීම් කටයුතු වඩා ඵලදායී කිරීමට සායනික අධීක්ෂණය සම්බන්ධ නරගත හැකි බව විමසීමක් කරණු ලබයි. මෙම අධානයට දැනට පවතින අධීක්ෂණ කිුයාවලියේ සොයා බැලීමක් කරන අතර එය අධාාපනයේ ගුණාත්මකභාවයට බලපාන අයුරු විමසීමක් කරයි. තවද එය අධීක්ෂණ කුම තුළින් වඩා ඵලදායී අධීක්ෂණ කුම හඳුනාගෙන ඒ තුළින් අධීක්ෂකයින් හා උපාධාායරිවරුන් බලගතු කිරීම උත්පේුරණය කිරීම තුළින් අධීක්ෂණයට භාජනය වන පිරිසගේ ආත්ම විශ්වාසය වැඩි කිරීම උත්පේරණය හා කැපවීම තුළින් වඩා පුශස්ථ ඉගෙනුම් ඉගැන්වීම් කිුයාවලියක් තුළින් ඉගෙනුම ලබන සිසුන් එහි පුතිලාභ ලබන්නන් කිරීම පුධාන පරමාර්ථයකි. අවසාන වශයෙන් පුජාතන්තුවාදී උපකාරී කිරීමට නැඹුරු වූ සායනික අධීක්ෂණ කිුිිියාවලියක් සමෝධායනය කිරීම තුලින් විසි එකිවන ශත වර්ෂයට අදාළ ජාතික හා ගෝලීය අභිමතාර්ථ සාක්ෂාත් කරගැනීමට හැකිවනු ඇත.

පුමුඛ පද:- සායනික අධීක්ෂණය , දෙවන බස ඉගැන්වීම, සීමාවාසී පුහුණුවල අධීක්ෂකවරු, අධීක්ෂණයට භාජනය වන්නන්

Abstract

Authoritative power, fault finding, and criticism in traditional supervisory practices can have a considerable adverse impact on supervisees in any field. Clinical supervision, which was predominantly used in health sector is now being applied in many other fields including education. In Sri Lankan context, it is observable that many supervisors and mentors, who are involved in teacher training programmes have little knowledge on latest supervisory practices. This review article examines how the role of clinical supervisory practices can be incorporated for effective second language teaching and learning process by pre-service teacher trainees during their internship. This paper explores the weaknesses found in traditional supervisory practices and how it affects particularly second language teaching learning process leading to the quality of education. The research will be carried out through sequential explanatory mixed method. Both qualitative and quantitative research designs will be implemented. Data will be collected through interviews and questionnaires. Besides, one of the main objectives of this study is to examine how clinical supervision can be incorporated for more effective supervisory practices empowering the mentors and supervisors on their role and enabling the second language teacher trainees to be more confident, motivated and committed towards their performances leading to a more effective teaching learning process, from which finally learners can benefit, while achieving national and global objectives of education.

Key words:- Clinical supervision, second language teaching, internship, supervisors, supervisees

1. Introduction

'Supervision', one of the key components of teacher training programmes, plays a vital role in the development of trainee teachers' professional skills. The systematic practice of supervision by education administrators goes as far back as early 1830s when ordinary schools were established (Hernández-Ramos, 2010). Since then, this process has undergone many a transformation introducing more effective supervision models, which are currently in use in educational institutions like schools, teacher training colleges, universities etc.

Both learning English as well as teaching English have been in question in Sri Lankan context as a considerable percentage does not show the required competency at Ordinary Level examination (Brunfaut & Green, 2019). The introduction of the concept of National Colleges of Education (NCoEs) in 1985 to the system of Education in Sri Lanka, marked a new trend in the sphere of Pre-Service Teacher Training. This concept aimed at producing competent trained teachers with a view to uplifting the quality of teaching learning process leading to higher achievement levels (Nanayakkara & Neumann, 2015).

Since pre-service teacher trainees have no prior teaching experience, proper guidance and direction should be made available for them to acquire necessary skills for their future pedagogical practices. For this, their teaching practice component, particularly their internship period is of great importance, from which they lay a firm foundation connecting the theoretical base with the real classroom experience (Abas, 2020). It is a general assumption that the awareness of clinical supervision among many supervisors, mentors, senior teachers, and school management is relatively low in many supervisory roles played by them. Traditional supervision leads to a

number of issues mainly authoritative, oppressive control over supervisees by supervisors brings more harm than good (Kemal Kayıkçı1 Ozan Yılmaz & Şahin, 2016). Most of the interns of NCoEs attached to the government schools in Sri Lanka claimed to have encountered such traditional treatments, particularly by the mentors, senior teachers, and school management, when they are being supervised. Therefore, an awareness of clinical supervision and the need of a viable and more effective mechanism for supervision is felt ever than before.

This article aims at enlightening the supervisors and widening their horizon to play a better role in assisting the second language teacher trainees to be more confident to execute a better service achieving the objectives and the goals of teacher education and national objectives of education.

1.1 Research Background

Supervision is an important aspect in education, which contributes to the overall enhancement of quality of education in any country. Teacher Training in Sri Lanka turned a new leaf in the history of Teacher Education with the introduction of the concept of National Colleges of Education (NCoEs) by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education in mid 1980s. Until then, teachers were recruited based on their basic educational qualifications and subsequently, they were absorbed to Teachers' Colleges, from which they obtained two-year institutional inservice training. Prior to the commencement of their training, they were required to work in schools as untrained teachers without being aware of proper pedagogical skills and a clear perception of what the expected role from them was, until they were given the training (Nanayakkara and Neumann, 2015).

The quality of education thus has been affected negatively as one of the main reasons is supervisory practices being used in

Sri Lanka for teacher training, have not proved to be successful (Wanasinghe and Nawastheen, 2020). With a view to ensuring quality teaching/learning process the concept of National Colleges of Education was introduced in 1985 as mentioned above. For this, Advanced Level qualified non-graduates are recruited on basis of their Z-score. Initially, they are given two-year institutional training and third year is meant for internship training. Thus, for the first time in Sri Lanka, pre-service teacher training was introduced. At present, there are nineteen NCoEs operating in different parts of the country for training teachers for different subjects like English, Science, Maths, Information Technology, Physical Education, Second language Sinhala, Second language Tamil etc.

However, there is apparently little guidance on how supervision should be carried out during the internship training of these trainees, other than the guidelines provided by the National Institute of Education (NIE). Though there are guidelines for internship supervision, lack of uniformity is a major issue (Nanayakkara and Neumann, 2015). Despite awareness programmes and workshops being organized by NCoEs for mentors and principals of the internship schools, at operational level, it is observed that mentors and school management as well as some lecturers have their own ways of supervision. Many interns complain that they get criticized and often become embarrassed in the presence of their students. Reasons like lack of discussion, negotiation, and absence of friendly democratic nature on the part of the supervisor have deprived many interns of developing a positive attitude towards their future career. A common evaluation sheet with a set of criteria is given to NCoE lecturers, mentors and principals of internship schools for observation and supervision purposes. After supervision, feedback is given mainly with common group discussions and briefings. There is little evidence of using clinical supervision

for these teacher trainees and assisting them to overcome their problems.

Besides, there is very little research on supervision in Sri Lankan context to explore the possibilities of applying more effective supervisory practices to enhance the quality of supervisors and pre-service teacher training programmes.

Under these circumstances, it is felt as a timely need to explore this background and propose a better solution, from which the supervisees can benefit, while supervisors develop their supervisory practices in a better way enhancing the quality of teacher training programmes in the country.

1.2 Problem of the study

In terms of supervisory practices used by supervisors for teacher training in Sri Lankan context call for more attention. Particularly, pre-service second language teacher trainees of NCoEs, who are constantly subjected to supervision during teaching practice sessions and internship, face more problems than other teacher trainees. Most of them have problems with the target language, and teaching part of it with the subject knowledge.

It is observable that traditional supervisory practices are still used by many mentors and some NCoE lecturers, which have a negative impact towards their professional development, as from such supervisory practices, teacher trainees have not been able to improve their pedagogical practices. There are many reasons for that. One is that the non-availability of a proper mechanism to educate and empower teachers with new trends in education. Another one could be the lack of interest particularly among supervisors to move away from traditional approaches.

As a result of this, teacher trainees, who are waiting to join teaching profession, do not get what they are supposed to get from mentors other than criticism and fault finding. Many mentors are of the opinion that their job is to observe lessons of interns of that school and make comments on the lesson plan and offer marks or a grade finally. Particularly, lack of negotiation, absence of democratic atmosphere, friendly conversation, mutual trust, motivation, praising etc. are very rare qualities to be witnessed. What results from this is a production of similar set of teachers to the system ultimately. Therefore, this gap between the use of rather traditional supervisory practices and introduction of a more effective supervisory instrument is the need of the hour in order to ensure quality for a more effective teaching and learning process, through which learners can reach higher achievement levels and on the other hand teachers, and mentors can develop professionally.

1.3 The objectives of the study

- i. To find out the limitations of the current supervisory practices adapted by mentors for pre-service teacher training.
- ii. To identify how help-oriented aspect of clinical supervision could be incorporated for observation of teaching practice of interns, who teach English as a second language.
- iii. To explore the application of post conference of clinical supervision on supervisory practices.

1.4 Significance of the Study

(Sarfo & Cudjoe, 2016) point out citing Glickman, Gordon and Gordon (2004) that supervision as the backbone, which can determine the effectiveness of school. A good supervision generally involves activities that aid, direct and

inform teachers of what should be done or have been done and not merely finding faults of what teachers do during teaching learning process.

It is quite observable that particularly in pre-service teacher training, for which supervision plays a vital role; supervision done by some NCoE lecturers, and mentors and principals at internship schools need to be updated with new trends in supervision. Use of traditional supervisory practices is a common occurrence, from which teacher trainees hardly get a kind of improvement or motivation towards their professional development. Therefore, this study will help NCoE lecturers, mentors and principals of internship schools to enhance their supervisory practices leading to more effective teaching and learning process, through which a quality improvement in both teaching and learning could be guaranteed.

Not only pre-service second language teacher trainees, but there are also in-service teacher training programmes, Higher National Diplomas and Post Graduate Diplomas, for which a sound supervision is required. This paper which will be introduced incorporating certain aspects of clinical supervisory practices, could equally be used for these programmes as well. As a whole, this can bring more quality to the system of education, as supervisors, supervisees and students can benefit ultimately.

The other significance of this attempt is that apparently very little research work has been carried out on this topic with a view to enhancing pre-teacher training in Sri Lankan context.

Supervision is an area, which is constantly subjected to researchable arguments and discussions. Hence, this kind of investigation will be of immense importance for further research work, which will investigate more possibilities to enhance supervisory practices.

1.5 Limitations of the study

There are nineteen NCoEs around the country including almost all the provinces training pre-service teacher training for many subjects such as English, Science, Maths, Primary, Second language Sinahala and Tamil and so on. This paper focuses only on teacher trainees who teach English as a second language and the supervisory role played by the mentors of Internship schools and NCoE lecturers who supervise the interns during the internship period.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Traditional Supervisory Practices

It is a common feature that particularly in the Sri Lankan context, though supervision is done for pre-service teacher training programmes at different stages by the lecturers at National College of Education and the mentors appointed at internship schools, a proper understanding of effective supervision remains relatively at a lower level. This is quite similar to the situation in which (Gürsoy, Kesner and Salihoğlu, 2016) reveal referring to their research, where university supervisors play a rather traditional role They refer to it as a mechanistically routinized series of actions. They suggest that supervisors are also expected to act as active agents in conflict resolution and problem solving in the practicum. Proper supervision requires the establishment of mutual understanding among all stakeholders involved in the practicum. Therefore, a proper understanding of supervision is of prime importance for teacher trainees to accomplish a better and a quality service.

These traditional practices are a common feature not only in Sri Lanka but also in many parts of the world. A research study carried out in Addis Ababa, taking government primary school

into consideration (Kemal Kayıkçı1 Ozan Yılmaz & Şahin, 2016), share a similar view to that of the above. The finding of the study reveals that supervisors were not properly performing their role as clinical supervisors; the class observation being practiced was not effective in carrying out as expected. This study recommends that education officers should take initiatives to train supervisors giving them a sound knowledge of latest trends in supervisory practices if the quality of teachers and education is to be developed. This indicates how crucial the supervisory role is in developing teacher performance and the quality of education.

Besides, researchers have repeatedly mentioned that supervision approaches used by some supervisors are less encouraging. Many young pre-service trainees get embarrassed in the presence of the students due to rather authoritative supervising strategies employed by the supervisors (Kemal Kayıkçı1 Ozan Yılmaz & Şahin, 2016). disclose that traditional supervision creates different problems, since it mostly functions as a threatening tool for employment which causes fear on teachers and is conducted in the domains needed by supervisors rather than the domains needed by teachers.

It is a general assumption that quality teaching and instruction have a direct bearing on successful learning. Supervision, on the other hand, is accepted as a general leadership function, which aims at improving teachers' performance and instruction (Sarfo & Cudjoe, 2016). (Glickman, Gordon and Gordon (2004) have emphasized the importance of supervision referring to it as the backbone towards the effectiveness of school (Kemal Kayıkçıl Ozan Yılmaz & Şahin, 2016). They further elaborate that good supervision is a process that assists, directs and informs teachers of what they should and should not do, and also not just finding faults of the supervisee when teaching.

2.2 Clinical Supervision

(Sarfo & Cudjoe, 2016) citing Barber and Norman, (1987) mention that supervision, in common usage, refers to overseeing, and it is a basic component of counselling process. In other words, supervision is described as an interpersonal process in which the skilled practitioner or supervisor helps the less skilled practitioner in relation to their professional development. With regard to clinical supervision, Sarfo & Cudjoe, 2016 citing Oliva & Pawlas, 2004 state that clinical supervision is a supervisory practice, which is in practice now, based on the assumption that with guidance and assistance, teachers are in a position to execute their pedagogical practices more effectively. Since clinical supervision involves careful and systematic observation, analysis and dialogue with a supervisor, effective teaching can be reinforced leading to improvement in teachers' pedagogical capabilities. Unlike in traditional supervision, the objectives of clinical supervision are clearly stated by both the supervisor and the supervisee before the observation and the mutual trusted manner by both parties, reduces much of the anxiety or tension associated with traditional classroom observation or inspections by supervisors. Since there is a climate devoid of such tension and suspicion, there is a greater possibility of achieving the objectives set by both supervisor and supervisee.

2.3 Clinical Supervision in Teacher Education

In contemporary supervisory practices, the approaches of supervision have undergone drastic changes along with the developments in other fields, such as management, health and so on.

The growing recognition of Clinical Supervision (CS) in the field of teacher education is apparent in many countries as it has proved to be a popular and an effective approach for

the improvement of instructional behavior of teachers (Abera, 2017). Falender and Shafranske, 2004 emphasize that clinical supervision is the development of testable knowledge, skills and values or attitudes, through supervision; on the other hand, supervisors need to develop competence to deliver supervision (Hill et al., 2016),(Sarfo & Cudjoe, 2016). This clearly indicates that it is a two-way process, through which both supervisor and supervisee in a collaborative manner, are engaged for the purpose of improving their performances. Kühne et al., 2019 citing Milne and Watkins describe supervision process as a relationship-based education and training, which supports, develops and evaluates the work of colleague/s.

Therefore, the aim of supervision should ensure quality, emotional support and therapeutic competence. Initially clinical supervision was a dominant area in the field of medicine, yet, its significance has been felt by many over the time and it has been accepted as an effective approach for supervision in the field of education.

Mahare, S.M. 2018 conducting research in Zimbabwe, mentions that clinical supervision model is like a vehicle by which professional development and teacher growth can be driven towards better performances. In other words, it leads to improvement in teaching performance, improvement of classroom instruction, and facilitation of student learning. Khaef & Karimnia, 2021 drawing the conclusion of their study conducted in Iran confirm that face to face interactions with different teachers with divers teaching methods and techniques provide valuable opportunity to improve and update their own pedagogical practices. Besides, they emphasize the improvement of professional development and the perspectives of supervisory practices, which in turn creates a healthy atmosphere for the supervisees to work in a stress-free environment. Due to the

collaborative nature of this encounter, the conventional pressure of instructors would turn into a more democratic negotiation. The prevalence of an atmosphere of this nature is what generally any supervisee expects. The objective of supervision can be easily be achieved if this kind of approach is adapted for not only second language teacher trainees, but for any category. Pertti Alasuutari et al., 2008 in the conclusions of their study show that, overall, students prefer a more positive, supportive clinical learning environment and they often perceive differences in the actual learning environment and the preferred learning environment. In teaching and even teacher education, fostering a superviseecentric environment, listening to supervisees, offering additional support, providing constructive feedback, and facilitating the meeting of individual learning needs, innovation, promoting supervisees' voice etc. are highly recommended for an effective learning environment as well as a teaching/learning process. If this is implemented for supervision purposes, the supervisory processes will have positive impact on the development of professional skills of trainees, and the trainees will be able to derive a higher degree of satisfaction rather than frequent disappointments, which will eventually ensure a process of quality teaching and learning.

3. Research Method

Three broad methods are commonly used for conducting literature reviews, namely i. Systematic ii. Semi-systematic and iii. Integrative method (Snyder, 2019) depending on the nature of the research work being carried out. For this review article, semi-systematic approach was employed as the aim of overviewing a topic through this approach is done often looking at how research within a selected field has progressed over time or how a topic has developed through research work. This review article thus discusses the researches done on clinical

supervision and how it can be applied in educational setting, particularly supervisory practices for teacher training, and its effect on supervisees for quality of pedagogical practices and professional improvement. This study applies meta narrative approach to systematic review, which is designed for topic areas researched by diverse research traditions. Since this approach identifies, synthesizes, and interprets diverse body of literature in a given topic area, (Kim et al., 2021) this study was done systematically collecting and analyzing literature addressing the impact of clinical supervision on supervisory practices on preservice teacher training.



Fig. -1 Conceptual framework

3.2 Hypotheses

- H1. Clinical supervision can prepare teacher trainees to be more confident for their teaching practice component.
- H2. Clinical supervision can change the mindset of both supervisee and supervisor towards more effective supervision in teacher training.
- H3. Democratic and help-oriented supervisory practices in clinical supervision can develop both supervisee and supervisory role leading to a quality improvement.

4. Discussion and Results

Research conducted on clinical supervision and its effect on supervisors and supervisees and the quality of work carried out by supervisees in the field of education, particularly teacher training, show a distinct difference when compared with traditional supervisory approaches. A study conducted by Gürsoy, Kesner and Salihoğlu, 2016 in Turkey confirms over the results of their research that a clinical supervision model used by university supervisors for teacher trainees, who were in the experimental group, had proved to be a great success over the control group.

Another research study carried out in Addis Ababa, taking government primary school into consideration (Kemal Kayıkçı1 Ozan Yılmaz and Şahin, 2016), shares the view that how traditional supervisory practices affect supervisees in the long run. The finding of the study reveals that supervisors were not properly performing their role as clinical supervisors; the class observation being practiced was not effective in carrying out as expected. This study recommends that education officers should take initiatives to train supervisors giving them a sound knowledge of latest trends in supervisory practices if the quality of teachers and education is to be developed. This indicates how instrumental the supervisory role is in developing teacher performance and the quality of education.

Besides, researchers have repeatedly mentioned that supervision approaches used by some supervisors are less encouraging. Many young pre-service trainees get criticized in the presence of the students due to rather authoritative supervising strategies employed by the supervisors A study carried out by (Kemal Kayıkçıl Ozan Yılmaz and Şahin, 2016). discloses that traditional supervision creates different problems, since it

mostly functions as a threatening tool for employment which causes fear on teachers and is conducted in the domains needed by supervisors rather than the domains needed by teachers.

The increasing recognition of Clinical Supervision (CS) in the field of teacher education is apparent in many countries as it has proved to be a popular and an effective approach for the improvement of instructional behavior of teachers Abera, (2017), Falender and Shafranske, (2004) emphasize that clinical supervision is the development of testable knowledge, skills and values or attitudes, through supervision; on the other hand, supervisors need to develop competence to deliver supervision

In this regard, it is quite clear that the growing popularity and effectiveness of clinical supervision in the field of education, particularly in teacher training, either second language or any other subject, can have a very positive impact on the quality of teaching learning process due to its democratic and relationshipbased encounter between supervisor and supervisee.

5. Conclusion and suggestions

In conclusion, it is clear that much research work has been carried out to highlight the effectiveness of clinical supervision in the field of education, particularly teacher training processes. Especially second language teacher trainees, who struggle with the subject knowledge and the target language, need more attention, care and professional guidance, and a help-oriented approach through which they can be trained. An awareness of clinical supervision should be given to the mentors and supervisors to play their supervisory role more effectively. Hence, policy planners, curriculum designers, and the other relevant higher authorities should consider and reconsider the proper channels through which supervisors of the education system be educated and made aware of clinical supervision to play a more effective role.

References

- Abas, A. (2020). Developing A Pre-Service Teachers Clinical Supervision Assessment. July 2019.
- Abera, T. (2017). Teachers' and Supervisors' Perceptions of Supervision Practices in Public Secondary Schools in East Shoa Zone, Oromia Region. International Journal of Sciences, 3(04), 18–27. https://doi.org/10.18483/ijsci.1219
- Brunfaut, T., & Green, R. (2019). TRANSFORM project English language assessment in Sri Lanka Current national English language assessment in Sri Lanka and Comparison with the larger region. February.
- Hernández-Ramos, P. (2010). A. Collins, R. Halverson: Rethinking education in the age of technology. The digital revolution and schooling in America. Educational Technology Research and Development, 58(5), 609–611. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-010-9159-0
- Hill, H. R. M., Crowe, T. P., & Gonsalvez, C. J. (2016). Reflective dialogue in clinical supervision: A pilot study involving collaborative review of supervision videos. Psychotherapy Research, 26(3), 263–278. https://doi.org/10.1080/10503307.2014.996795
- Kemal Kayıkçı1 Ozan Yılmaz, & Şahin, A. (2016). The Views of Educational Supervisors on Clinical Supervision. Journal of Education and Practice, 6(33), 99–105. www.iiste.org
- Khaef, E., & Karimnia, A. (2021). The Effects of Implementing Clinical Supervision Model on Supervisors' Teaching Perspectives and Qualifications: A Case Study in an EFL Context. Education Research International, 2021. https://doi.org/10.1155/2021/6138873
- Kim, J., Harris-Roxas, B., de Leeuw, E., Lilley, D., Crimeen, A., & Sainsbury, P. (2021). Protocol for a meta-narrative review on research paradigms addressing the urban built environment and human health. Systematic Reviews, 10(1), 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1186/s13643-021-01848-6
- Kühne, F., Maas, J., Wiesenthal, S., & Weck, F. (2019). Empirical research in clinical supervision: A systematic review and suggestions for future studies. BMC Psychology, 7(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40359-019-0327-7

Nanayakkara, G. L. S., & Neumann, K. D. (2015). Quality Assurance in Sri Lankan Teacher Training Evaluation Procedures for the Assessment of the Internship Period. January 2006.

- Pertti Alasuutari, Bickman, L., & Brannen, J. (2008). The SAGE Handbook Social Research Methods.
- Sarfo, F. K., & Cudjoe, B. (2016). Supervisors 'Knowledge and Use of Clinical Supervision to Promote Teacher Performance in basic schools. International Journal of Education and Research, 4(1), 87–100.
- Snyder, H. (2019). Literature review as a research methodology: An overview and guidelines. Journal of Business Research, 104(August), 333–339. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.07.039